

01  
02  
03  
04  
05  
06  
07  
08  
09  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43

# Introduction to Meta-Analysis

**Michael Borenstein**

*Biostat, Inc, New Jersey, USA.*

**Larry V. Hedges**

*Northwestern University, Evanston, USA.*

**Julian P.T. Higgins**

*MRC, Cambridge, UK.*

**Hannah R. Rothstein**

*Baruch College, New York, USA.*



A John Wiley and Sons, Ltd., Publication

01 This edition first published 2009  
02 © 2009 John Wiley & Sons, Ltd

03 *Registered office*

04 John Wiley & Sons Ltd, The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, United Kingdom

05 For details of our global editorial offices, for customer services and for information about how to apply for  
06 permission to reuse the copyright material in this book please see our website at [www.wiley.com](http://www.wiley.com).

07 The right of the author to be identified as the author of this work has been asserted in accordance with the  
08 Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

09 All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted,  
10 in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as  
11 permitted by the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, without the prior permission of the publisher.

12 Wiley also publishes its books in a variety of electronic formats. Some content that appears in print may not be  
13 available in electronic books.

14 Designations used by companies to distinguish their products are often claimed as trademarks. All brand  
15 names and product names used in this book are trade names, service marks, trademarks or registered  
16 trademarks of their respective owners. The publisher is not associated with any product or vendor mentioned  
17 in this book. This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the  
18 subject matter covered. It is sold on the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering  
19 professional services. If professional advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent  
20 professional should be sought.

21 *Library of Congress Cataloguing-in-Publication Data*

22 Introduction to meta-analysis / Michael Borenstein . . . [et al.].

23 p. ; cm.

24 Includes bibliographical references and index.

25 ISBN 978-0-470-05724-7 (cloth)

26 1. Meta-analysis. I. Borenstein, Michael.

27 [DNLM: 1. Meta-Analysis as Topic. WA 950 I614 2009].

28 R853.M48I58 2009

29 610.72—dc22

2008043732

30 A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

31 ISBN: 978-0-470-05724-7

32 Set in 10.5/13pt Times by Integra Software Services Pvt. Ltd, Pondicherry, India

33 Printed in the UK by TJ International, Padstow, Cornwall

34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43

---

# Contents

---

01  
02  
03  
04  
05  
06  
07  
08  
09  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43

List of Tables	xiii
List of Figures	xv
Acknowledgements	xix
Preface	xxi
Web site	xxix

## **PART 1: INTRODUCTION**

<b>1 HOW A META-ANALYSIS WORKS</b>	<b>3</b>
Introduction	3
Individual studies	3
The summary effect	5
Heterogeneity of effect sizes	6
Summary points	7
<b>2 WHY PERFORM A META-ANALYSIS</b>	<b>9</b>
Introduction	9
The streptokinase meta-analysis	10
Statistical significance	11
Clinical importance of the effect	12
Consistency of effects	12
Summary points	14

## **PART 2: EFFECT SIZE AND PRECISION**

<b>3 OVERVIEW</b>	<b>17</b>
Treatment effects and effect sizes	17
Parameters and estimates	18
Outline of effect size computations	19
<b>4 EFFECT SIZES BASED ON MEANS</b>	<b>21</b>
Introduction	21
Raw (unstandardized) mean difference $D$	21
Standardized mean difference, $d$ and $g$	25
Response ratios	30
Summary points	32

01	<b>5 EFFECT SIZES BASED ON BINARY DATA (<math>2 \times 2</math> TABLES)</b>	<b>33</b>
02	Introduction	33
03	Risk ratio	34
04	Odds ratio	36
05	Risk difference	37
06	Choosing an effect size index	38
07	Summary points	39
08		
09	<b>6 EFFECT SIZES BASED ON CORRELATIONS</b>	<b>41</b>
10	Introduction	41
11	Computing $r$	41
12	Other approaches	43
13	Summary points	43
14		
15	<b>7 CONVERTING AMONG EFFECT SIZES</b>	<b>45</b>
16	Introduction	45
17	Converting from the log odds ratio to $d$	47
18	Converting from $d$ to the log odds ratio	47
19	Converting from $r$ to $d$	48
20	Converting from $d$ to $r$	48
21	Summary points	49
22		
23		
24	<b>8 FACTORS THAT AFFECT PRECISION</b>	<b>51</b>
25	Introduction	51
26	Factors that affect precision	52
27	Sample size	52
28	Study design	53
29	Summary points	55
30		
31	<b>9 CONCLUDING REMARKS</b>	<b>57</b>
32		
33	<b>PART 3: FIXED-EFFECT VERSUS RANDOM-EFFECTS MODELS</b>	
34		
35	<b>10 OVERVIEW</b>	<b>61</b>
36	Introduction	61
37	Nomenclature	62
38		
39	<b>11 FIXED-EFFECT MODEL</b>	<b>63</b>
40	Introduction	63
41	The true effect size	63
42	Impact of sampling error	63
43		

01	Performing a fixed-effect meta-analysis	65
02	Summary points	67
03		
04	<b>12 RANDOM-EFFECTS MODEL</b>	<b>69</b>
05	Introduction	69
06	The true effect sizes	69
07	Impact of sampling error	70
08	Performing a random-effects meta-analysis	72
09	Summary points	74
10		
11	<b>13 FIXED-EFFECT VERSUS RANDOM-EFFECTS MODELS</b>	<b>77</b>
12	Introduction	77
13	Definition of a summary effect	77
14	Estimating the summary effect	78
15	Extreme effect size in a large study or a small study	79
16	Confidence interval	80
17	The null hypothesis	83
18	Which model should we use?	83
19	Model should not be based on the test for heterogeneity	84
20	Concluding remarks	85
21	Summary points	85
22		
23	<b>14 WORKED EXAMPLES (PART 1)</b>	<b>87</b>
24	Introduction	87
25	Worked example for continuous data (Part 1)	87
26	Worked example for binary data (Part 1)	92
27	Worked example for correlational data (Part 1)	97
28	Summary points	102
29		
30		
31	<b>PART 4: HETEROGENEITY</b>	
32		
33	<b>15 OVERVIEW</b>	<b>105</b>
34	Introduction	105
35	Nomenclature	106
36	Worked examples	106
37		
38	<b>16 IDENTIFYING AND QUANTIFYING HETEROGENEITY</b>	<b>107</b>
39	Introduction	107
40	Isolating the variation in true effects	107
41	Computing $Q$	109
42	Estimating $\tau^2$	114
43	The $I^2$ statistic	117

01	Comparing the measures of heterogeneity	119
02	Confidence intervals for $\tau^2$	122
03	Confidence intervals (or uncertainty intervals) for $I^2$	124
04	Summary points	125
05		
06	<b>17 PREDICTION INTERVALS</b>	<b>127</b>
07	Introduction	127
08	Prediction intervals in primary studies	127
09	Prediction intervals in meta-analysis	129
10	Confidence intervals and prediction intervals	131
11	Comparing the confidence interval with the prediction interval	132
12	Summary points	133
13		
14	<b>18 WORKED EXAMPLES (PART 2)</b>	<b>135</b>
15	Introduction	135
16	Worked example for continuous data (Part 2)	135
17	Worked example for binary data (Part 2)	139
18	Worked example for correlational data (Part 2)	143
19	Summary points	147
20		
21	<b>19 SUBGROUP ANALYSES</b>	<b>149</b>
22	Introduction	149
23	Fixed-effect model within subgroups	151
24	Computational models	161
25	Random effects with separate estimates of $\tau^2$	164
26	Random effects with pooled estimate of $\tau^2$	171
27	The proportion of variance explained	179
28	Mixed-effects model	183
29	Obtaining an overall effect in the presence of subgroups	184
30	Summary points	186
31		
32	<b>20 META-REGRESSION</b>	<b>187</b>
33	Introduction	187
34	Fixed-effect model	188
35	Fixed or random effects for unexplained heterogeneity	193
36	Random-effects model	196
37	Summary points	203
38		
39	<b>21 NOTES ON SUBGROUP ANALYSES AND META-REGRESSION</b>	<b>205</b>
40	Introduction	205
41	Computational model	205
42	Multiple comparisons	208
43	Software	209
	Analyses of subgroups and regression analyses are observational	209

01	Statistical power for subgroup analyses and meta-regression	210
02	Summary points	211
03		
04	<b>PART 5: COMPLEX DATA STRUCTURES</b>	
05		
06	<b>22 OVERVIEW</b>	<b>215</b>
07		
08	<b>23 INDEPENDENT SUBGROUPS WITHIN A STUDY</b>	<b>217</b>
09	Introduction	217
10	Combining across subgroups	218
11	Comparing subgroups	222
12	Summary points	223
13		
14	<b>24 MULTIPLE OUTCOMES OR TIME-POINTS WITHIN A STUDY</b>	<b>225</b>
15	Introduction	225
16	Combining across outcomes or time-points	226
17	Comparing outcomes or time-points within a study	233
18	Summary points	238
19		
20	<b>25 MULTIPLE COMPARISONS WITHIN A STUDY</b>	<b>239</b>
21	Introduction	239
22	Combining across multiple comparisons within a study	239
23	Differences between treatments	240
24	Summary points	241
25		
26	<b>26 NOTES ON COMPLEX DATA STRUCTURES</b>	<b>243</b>
27	Introduction	243
28	Summary effect	243
29	Differences in effect	244
30		
31	<b>PART 6: OTHER ISSUES</b>	
32		
33	<b>27 OVERVIEW</b>	<b>249</b>
34		
35	<b>28 VOTE COUNTING – A NEW NAME FOR AN OLD PROBLEM</b>	<b>251</b>
36	Introduction	251
37	Why vote counting is wrong	252
38	Vote counting is a pervasive problem	253
39	Summary points	255
40		
41	<b>29 POWER ANALYSIS FOR META-ANALYSIS</b>	<b>257</b>
42	Introduction	257
43	A conceptual approach	257
	In context	261
	When to use power analysis	262

01	Planning for precision rather than for power	263
02	Power analysis in primary studies	263
03	Power analysis for meta-analysis	267
04	Power analysis for a test of homogeneity	272
05	Summary points	275
06		
07	<b>30 PUBLICATION BIAS</b>	<b>277</b>
08	Introduction	277
09	The problem of missing studies	278
10	Methods for addressing bias	280
11	Illustrative example	281
12	The model	281
13	Getting a sense of the data	281
14	Is there evidence of any bias?	283
15	Is the entire effect an artifact of bias?	284
16	How much of an impact might the bias have?	286
17	Summary of the findings for the illustrative example	289
18	Some important caveats	290
19	Small-study effects	291
20	Concluding remarks	291
21	Summary points	291
22		
23	<b>PART 7: ISSUES RELATED TO EFFECT SIZE</b>	
24		
25	<b>31 OVERVIEW</b>	<b>295</b>
26		
27	<b>32 EFFECT SIZES RATHER THAN <math>p</math>-VALUES</b>	<b>297</b>
28	Introduction	297
29	Relationship between $p$ -values and effect sizes	297
30	The distinction is important	299
31	The $p$ -value is often misinterpreted	300
32	Narrative reviews vs. meta-analyses	301
33	Summary points	302
34		
35	<b>33 SIMPSON'S PARADOX</b>	<b>303</b>
36	Introduction	303
37	Circumcision and risk of HIV infection	303
38	An example of the paradox	305
39	Summary points	308
40		
41	<b>34 GENERALITY OF THE BASIC INVERSE-VARIANCE METHOD</b>	<b>311</b>
42	Introduction	311
43	Other effect sizes	312
44	Other methods for estimating effect sizes	315
	Individual participant data meta-analyses	316



01	Bayesian approaches	318
02	Summary points	319
03		
04	<b>PART 8: FURTHER METHODS</b>	
05	<b>35 OVERVIEW</b>	<b>323</b>
06		
07	<b>36 META-ANALYSIS METHODS BASED ON DIRECTION AND <math>p</math>-VALUES</b>	<b>325</b>
08	Introduction	325
09	Vote counting	325
10	The sign test	325
11	Combining $p$ -values	326
12	Summary points	330
13		
14	<b>37 FURTHER METHODS FOR DICHOTOMOUS DATA</b>	<b>331</b>
15	Introduction	331
16	Mantel-Haenszel method	331
17	One-step (Peto) formula for odds ratio	336
18	Summary points	339
19		
20	<b>38 PSYCHOMETRIC META-ANALYSIS</b>	<b>341</b>
21	Introduction	341
22	The attenuating effects of artifacts	342
23	Meta-analysis methods	344
24	Example of psychometric meta-analysis	346
25	Comparison of artifact correction with meta-regression	348
26	Sources of information about artifact values	349
27	How heterogeneity is assessed	349
28	Reporting in psychometric meta-analysis	350
29	Concluding remarks	351
30	Summary points	351
31		
32	<b>PART 9: META-ANALYSIS IN CONTEXT</b>	
33	<b>39 OVERVIEW</b>	<b>355</b>
34		
35	<b>40 WHEN DOES IT MAKE SENSE TO PERFORM A META-ANALYSIS?</b>	<b>357</b>
36	Introduction	357
37	Are the studies similar enough to combine?	358
38	Can I combine studies with different designs?	359
39	How many studies are enough to carry out a meta-analysis?	363
40	Summary points	364
41		
42	<b>41 REPORTING THE RESULTS OF A META-ANALYSIS</b>	<b>365</b>
43	Introduction	365
	The computational model	366

01	Forest plots	366
02	Sensitivity analysis	368
03	Summary points	369
04		
05	<b>42 CUMULATIVE META-ANALYSIS</b>	<b>371</b>
06	Introduction	371
07	Why perform a cumulative meta-analysis?	373
08	Summary points	376
09		
10	<b>43 CRITICISMS OF META-ANALYSIS</b>	<b>377</b>
11	Introduction	377
12	One number cannot summarize a research field	378
13	The file drawer problem invalidates meta-analysis	378
14	Mixing apples and oranges	379
15	Garbage in, garbage out	380
16	Important studies are ignored	381
17	Meta-analysis can disagree with randomized trials	381
18	Meta-analyses are performed poorly	384
19	Is a narrative review better?	385
20	Concluding remarks	386
21	Summary points	386
22		
23	<b>PART 10: RESOURCES AND SOFTWARE</b>	
24		
25	<b>44 SOFTWARE</b>	<b>391</b>
26	Introduction	391
27	The software	392
28	Three examples of meta-analysis software	393
29	Comprehensive Meta-Analysis (CMA) 2.0	395
30	RevMan 5.0	398
31	Stata macros with Stata 10.0	400
32	Summary points	403
33		
34	<b>45 BOOKS, WEB SITES AND PROFESSIONAL ORGANIZATIONS</b>	<b>405</b>
35	Books on systematic review methods	405
36	Books on meta-analysis	405
37	Web sites	406
38		
39	<b>REFERENCES</b>	<b>409</b>
40	<b>INDEX</b>	<b>415</b>
41		
42		
43		